

**MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL
PLANTATION, FLORIDA**

January 11, 2012

The meeting was called to order by Councilwoman Uria, President of the City Council.

1. Roll Call by City Clerk:

Councilmember:	Ron Jacobs Robert A. Levy Lynn Stoner Peter S. Tingom Sharon Moody Uria
Mayor:	Diane Veltri Bendekovic
City Attorney:	Donald J. Lunny, Jr.

* * * * *

2. The invocation was offered by Councilwoman Uria.

The Pledge of Allegiance followed.

* * * * *

3. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - May 11, 2011

4. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - May 18, 2011

5. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - May 25, 2011

6. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - June 8, 2011

7. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - June 22, 2011

8. Approval of Minutes of Meeting - June 29, 2011

All items were approved as presented.

* * * * *

ITEMS SUBMITTED BY THE MAYOR

Mayor Bendekovic welcomed Councilman Levy back after being out for three weeks.

Councilman Levy expressed thanks to everyone who called and left messages; unfortunately, he was under doctor's orders not to speak.

* * * * *

Mayor Bendekovic read a Proclamation designating Sunday, January 15, 2012, as *Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Remembrance Day* in the City of Plantation.

Roxanne Valee (sic), with the Inter Faith Multi-Cultural Committee, accepted the proclamation.

* * * * *

Sharon Kent, Assistant Director of Parks and Recreation, made the following announcements:

- The City is hosting the USTA Plantation's Men and Women's Open Tennis Tournament. The Men's Tournament started January 6, 2012 and runs through Sunday, January 15, 2012. The Women's Tournament starts January 15, 2012 through January 22, 2012. This event is being held at the Frank Veltri Tennis Center.
- A Nature in the Woods class will be held on January 14, 2012 at the Kennedy Community Center between 10:00 a.m. to 11:00 a.m. for children three to seven years of age. The City of Plantation is in partnership with the Sawgrass Nature Center and they will be presenting "Wiggles the Snake".

* * * * *

Mayor Bendekovic made the following announcements:

- The Friends at the Library is starting on Wednesdays at 2:00 p.m. This season's series focuses on Philosophy of the Mind, Brain, Consciousness and Thinking Machines. The topics for January and February are January 25, 2012 - The Mind Body Problem; February 8, 2012 - What is it about Robots; and February 22, 2012 - Self Identity and Other Minds.
- The Historical Museum is closed this month to break down the Winter Wonderland Exhibit and will reopen on February 2, 2012.
- Kids Day off is at Plantation Central Park on Friday, January 20, 2012 between 7:30 a.m. and 6:00 p.m.

* * * * *

CONSENT AGENDA

As a Commissioner of the CRA, Mayor Bendekovic has a voting privilege on Item No.'s 33 and 37.

Mr. Lunny read the Consent Agenda by title.

9. Request by Kiwanis Club of Plantation to hold a car show in the Sears parking lot of the Westfield Broward Mall on Sunday, February 19, 2012 from 8:00 a.m. – 7:00 p.m.
10. Request to approve South Plantation High School Athletic Foundation's Food Truck Event, Friday, January 13, 2012 from 4:00 p.m. – 9:00 p.m.

11. Request for authorization of two emergency gravity sewer repairs in the 1700 block of North University Drive and at SW 78th Avenue and SW 13th Place by forced labor contractor, Jackson Land Development, in the amount of \$67,579.22. (Budgeted – Utilities)
12. Request for authorization to continue the purchase of anhydrous ammonia from Air Gas Specialty Products, using the Southeast Florida Co-Operative bid #2008-19 through January 31, 2013, at a cost of \$0.68/per lb. for full or less-than-full truckloads. (Budgeted – Utilities)
13. Request for authorization to enter into an agreement with Royce Integrated Solutions in the amount of \$23,600 to provide gate security transponders at all three utility treatment plants to meet necessary limited access facility requirements. (Budgeted – Utilities)
14. Request for authorization to purchase a 200HP replacement variable frequency drive (VFD) unit on deep well pump no. 4, located at the Regional Wastewater Treatment Plant, in the amount of \$23,999 from the Sanders Company. (Budgeted – Utilities)
15. Request for authorization to purchase eighty-eight (88) recycling containers from AmSan in the amount of \$25,328.86 for the Single Stream Recycling Program.
16. Approve purchase of one (1) International Terrastar SFA 4x2 box truck from Rechten International Trucks, Inc., in the amount of \$49,369. (Budgeted – Broward County Single Stream Recycling Program Grant)
17. Approve purchase of one (1) International 4300M7 SBA 4x2 8 yard dump truck from Rechten International Trucks, Inc., in the amount of \$66,189. (Budgeted – Public Works)
18. Request for authorization to purchase 2,950 Edge Otto 65-gallon toter carts from Waste management in the amount of \$132,750 for the Single Stream Recycling Program.
19. Request for approval to renew the City's Boiler & Machinery Insurance Policy with Hartford in the amount of \$29,168.80.
20. **Resolution No. 11412**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 1021 Renmar Drive. (Palpallatoc)
21. **Resolution No. 11413**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 8152 NW 15th Manor. (Williams)
22. **Resolution No. 11414**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 542 NW 98th Avenue. (Motter)
23. **Resolution No. 11415**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 5301 Pine Terrace. (Delgado)

24. **Resolution No. 11416**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 208 Farmington Drive. (Schott)
25. **Resolution No. 11417**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 911 NW 79th Terrace. (Siegel)
26. **Resolution No. 11418**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 120 Jacaranda Country Club Drive. (Pettis)
27. **Resolution No. 11419**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 8220 NW 12th Court. (Shah)
28. **Resolution No. 11420**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 9865 NW 5th Court. (Mannino)
29. **Resolution No. 11421**
RESOLUTION confirming a Plantation City Lien of Utilities Service Charges for 8135 NW 17th Manor. (Dunkley)
30. **Resolution No. 11422**
RESOLUTION approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 8 – December 28, 2011 for the Plantation Gateway Development District.
31. **Resolution No. 11423**
RESOLUTION approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 8 – December 28, 2011 for the Plantation Midtown Development District.
32. **Resolution No. 11424**
RESOLUTION approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 8 – December 28, 2011.
33. **Resolution No. 11425**
RESOLUTION approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 8 – December 28, 2011 for the City of Plantation's Community Redevelopment Agency.
34. **Resolution No. 11426**
RESOLUTION approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 29, 2011 through January 4, 2012 for the Plantation Gateway Development District.

Resolution No. 11427

35. **RESOLUTION** approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 29, 2011 through January 4, 2012 for the Plantation Midtown Development District.

Resolution No. 11428

36. **RESOLUTION** approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 29, 2011 through January 4, 2012.

Resolution No. 11429

37. **RESOLUTION** approving the expenditures and appropriations reflected in the Weekly Expenditure Report for the period December 29, 2011 through January 4, 2012 for the City of Plantation's Community Redevelopment Agency.

NON-AGENDA

- 37A. Request for approval to engage Kucera International to perform Aerial Orthophotographic services for the City's GIS system at the lowest competitive procured bid of \$35,840.

A memorandum dated January 11, 2012 to Mayor Diane Veltri Bendekovic and City Council Members, from Robert Castro, IT Director, follows:

This information is provided for your review and consideration regarding your approval of the funds to purchase Aerial Orthophotographic services for the City. The City solicited quotes through a faxed quote (FQ) process and online through Demand Star, and of the several proposals received, selected Kucera International, Inc. as the most responsive, most qualified proposal, and the lowest bidder.

DELIVERABLES:

Provide new digital aerial photography, ground control, and accuracy checkpoint surveying, and 0.2' resolution color digital orthophotography covering the entire geographic area of the City (approx. 21 square miles).

BENEFITS:

These new digital ortho-pictures will enable the IT Department to refresh the present high resolution orthographics that were taken back in 2005 to more accurately represent in the City's GIS the layout and canopy of the City and continue to fulfill GIS initiatives.

COSTS:

Kucera International, Inc. submitted the lowest bid at \$35,840.

RECOMMENDATION:

Therefore, it is recommended that City Council approve the budgeted (Utilities) funds to engage Kucera International as the lowest bidder and authorize the Information Technology, Utilities, and Administration Departments to enter into an agreement with Kucera International to perform the stated work.

Motion by Councilman Tingom, seconded by Councilwoman Uria, to approve tonight's consent agenda as printed. Motion carried on the following roll call vote:

Ayes: Jacobs, Levy, Stoner, Tingom, Uria
Nays: None

NOTE: Mayor Bendekovic voted affirmatively on Item No.'s 33 and 37.

* * * * *

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

38. EMPLOYEE BENEFITS PRESENTATION.

A memorandum dated January 11, 2012 to City Council members, from Mayor Diane Veltri Bendekovic, follows:

At the October 26 and November 16, 2011 City Council meetings, you requested additional information on Senior Executive and General Employee benefits packages.

Per your request, we have put together the attached presentation outlining City of Plantation employee benefits packages and salary ranges as compared with other cities using the recent Public Employers Personnel Information Exchange (PEPIE) group data. It also identifies numerous benefits and cost savings changes that have been implemented over the past several years.

To clarify, PEPIE is a group of public sector human resource professionals in Broward and Palm Beach counties. Salary surveys are conducted annually, with results available each March, and benefits surveys are conducted at approximately three to five-year intervals. The salary comparison data is from March 2011; the benefits comparison data is from September 2011. The City of Plantation regularly participates in these surveys, and uses the data regularly to assess and prepare recommendations to City Council as appropriate.

If you should have any questions on the information provided, please contact Margie Moale, Human Resources Director, at 954-797-2240 or via e-mail at mmoale@Plantation.org.

Councilwoman Uria appreciates the information presented. She wanted to review this as a Workshop; however, this is just an informative process. She also appreciates the FOP information but expressed concerned about getting into a conversation about anything that is under contract at this time. She wanted clear information regarding the Senior Executive Package. She did not have a problem if this were discussed tonight; however, she would prefer to do it in a Workshop setting without the FOP information.

Councilperson Stoner concurred with Councilwoman Uria. Her recollection was that this was going to be done in a Workshop format. She also did not want to have this discussion with the FOP data; she believes it is inappropriate to mix General Employees and FOP. She reiterated that she did not want to discuss the FOP information.

Motion by Councilperson Stoner, seconded by Councilwoman Uria, to defer this item to a Workshop format without the FOP information included.

Ayes: Stoner, Uria

Nays: Jacobs, Levy, Tingom

Councilman Tingom disagreed with tabling the item; the information was provided. When this topic came up it was at the time we were talking about millage rates and how to balance the City's budget. He thanked Ms. Moale for taking the time to sit with him and discuss this presentation so that he would have a very clear understanding of it. He is prepared to discuss this tonight and noted that the FOP is 50% of our budget. Nothing can be addressed in terms of that without saying this is an actual cost. We do not have to discuss what we are going to do but these are the facts that exist and he believes now is the time to address this item.

In response to Councilman Levy, Mayor Bendekovic advised the reason this item went from a Workshop to a meeting was because if Council wants to vote they can do it as an Administrative item; whereas, in a Workshop there is usually a consensus. She reviewed the comments that were made for this presentation and the comments were that the information was needed prior to the budget discussion. When a Budget discussion is done you do not segregate one area from another. Everyone has to understand that the FOP is dictated by the Collective Bargaining; all she is doing is putting the facts out there. The facts support themselves; we do not have to discuss anything with the FOP but they are a part of our budget and the Police Department's budget is 48%. Salaries and benefits are 73.9% of our budget; therefore, she needed to include all 745 employees in this discussion this evening. Nothing has to be discussed about the FOP but the stats have to be presented. There will not be any vote on the FOP because that comes in the Spring when we start looking at the budget. When we discuss benefits of the General Employees; we are the Collective Bargaining unit because we are the ones that set their wages and benefits.

In response to Councilwoman Uria, Mayor Bendekovic indicated that this cannot be put on a Workshop next week because there is not a meeting. The presentation is ready to go this evening and she does not want to postpone it. The information was requested and she wants to provide it. There is no longer a Senior Executive Package. On November 16, 2011 it was said that there is no longer a Senior Executive Package except for those that were grandfathered in. The only thing in the Executive Package is Executive Days.

Councilwoman Uria stated that Council voted on not changing the Executive Package; the current Executive Package stays the same.

Mayor Bendekovic clarified that what was voted on was that the present directors would stay with the Executive Package and that the Executive Package would no longer be in existence as of October 1, 2011. The only thing left in the Executive Package was three Executive Days. If you want to discuss the Executive Days we can but there is nothing else left in the package.

Councilwoman Uria reiterated that she would prefer to do this as a Workshop format. This is just a fact-finding information.

Mayor Bendekovic provided an overview and Power Point presentation, which is of an informational nature only. The presentation is in response to the Council's request for personnel benefits information prior to the budget discussion. She requested that there be no breaks during the presentation due to the fact the concerns might be addressed and answered while proceeding through the presentation. It will also assist in the fluidity and the continuity of the presentation to hear it in its entirety without interruption. Hard copies have been

provided to Council if further clarification is needed at the end of the presentation. The public employees' personnel information exchange was used for comparison purposes within this presentation. PEPIE is a survey report of 44 municipalities within the State. It contains general information related to municipalities that participated in the 2011 PEPIE salary survey. The report provides benchmarks for each job description, compensation data for all jobs under management category and compensation data for all jobs under the general employee safety category. To name a few of the local participating municipalities; Coral Springs, Fort Lauderdale, Hallandale Beach, Hollywood, Lauderdale Lakes, Lauderhill, Miramar, Oakland Park, Pembroke Pines, Pompano and Sunrise. As we are all aware in the City's budget, salaries and benefits are the largest expenditure item. This year, City budget salaries and benefits percentage wise was 73.9%. This is because we are in the customer service and service industry. Since a presentation of this nature was requested for budgetary purposes it is all inclusive to include all 745 employees; 78% are General Employees and 22% are FOP employees.

The following topics were mentioned:

- Employee Population & Definitions
- Total Average Benefit Cost per Employee Type
- Grandfathering Changes
- Comparisons
- Plantation Holidays
- Other Agency Holidays
- Local Agency Holiday Comparison
- Other Agencies Honor some days that Plantation does not have as designated holidays
- Annual Leave
- Sick Leave
- Longevity Pay
- Tuition
- Salary Comparison of Market Value and Mid Point
- 2009 General Employee Wage Freeze and FOP Wage "Wait": Average 2009 W-2 Reportable Income
- 2010 General Employee Wage Freeze and FOP Wages: Average 2010 W-2 Reportable Income
- Assignment Pay
- Shift Differential
- Miscellaneous
- Pensions

Mayor Bendekovic requested that Council permit her to return another evening with the presentation should they want another in-depth discussion of the Pension Plan. She noted that the Council reviewed the Pension Plan several years ago with the Tier 1 and Tier 2. It was her recommendation to permit it to run its course and it will reduce the funding the City has to contribute to the pensions.

- Contributions

Mayor Bendekovic explained that General Employees and FOP employees have always contributed to their Pension Plan. General Employees on the Tier 1 plan will still contribute 8.5% and those on the Tier 2 plan will contribute 4%. FOP employees on the Tier 1 plan contribute 9.5% and those on the Tier 2 plan contribute 8%.

- Pensionable Wages
- COLA
- Pension Benefit Formulas
- Current Pension Contribution
- Impact of Tier 2
- How Does a Cash Balance Plan Work?

Mayor Bendekovic indicated that Councilman Jacobs requested information on a cash balance; however, since no one had ever heard of cash balance some research had to be done. Reading material was provided to each Council member. A summary of what a cash balance plan is was provided by Jeff Patrone, one of our consultants with Sageview. Should Council wish to have another discussion regarding the Pension, Mr. Patrone would have to be present.

- Health Insurance

Ms. Moale provided a breakdown of the insurance as follows:

Historical Medical Cost:

- ASO are the Administrative Service Charges that we pay to UHC, which is a flat fee to administer the claims and to administer our plan, then we pay the actual claim cost ourselves with stop loss kicking in at \$175,000 for any claim that might be over that plus the aggregate because we are partially insured.
- In April 2006 we were paying about \$10 million; we had three different insurance plans at that time.
- By consolidating plans in April 2007 to UHC under one umbrella the cost dropped \$3 million.
- The plan that ended April 2011 shows that we are paying less for insurance now than we were five and a half years ago.

Ms. Moale continued by reviewing the following:

- Medical Trend vs. Actual Expenses
- Health Insurance Changes Implemented in the Last Five Years to Control Costs:
- Employee Health & Wellness Care Center
- Utilization; Plan Year (PY) for 2011-12 based on seven months of data
- Wellness; Plan Year (PY) for 2011-12 based on seven months of data

Mayor Bendekovic thanked Ms. Moale for the presentation.

A summary of the presentation is as follows:

- Plantation has 745 employees, including the 163 FOP employees; the rest are General Employees, including Fire, Fire Rescue, and all of the Police and Administration.
- In researching the information; holidays and sick leaves are in line with other municipalities.
- Annual Leave is a little high after five years.
- Employee salaries vary; the City of Plantation was up front in addressing the rising Pension and Medical Costs.
- Tier 1 and Tier 2 were implemented. If given the opportunity, these tiers will reduce the City's funding in the years to come. In addition, the City has had a dramatic decrease in medical costs due to the

changes in our health care area, especially with the Wellness Center for employees, spouses and dependents starting at 12 years of age.

- All employees, starting in October, made a 4% contribution to their health benefits.
- Employees no longer receive turkey money, which was a tradition for decades.
- There is no more longevity pay.
- 583 employees have not had a wage increase in 2012, which is the second wage freeze in the last three years. The FOP is a bargaining unit; therefore, increases are dictated through the collective bargaining process.
- Personnel data was provided to Council, Ms. Moale, employees and the public, which generates 73.9% of our budget. This information will allow everyone a greater understanding of the employee's benefits and assist in budget preparation in June.

Mayor Bendekovic thanked Ms. Moale, Beverly Ambrosio, Gary Shimun and Susan DiLaura for the information and preparation which went into this evening's preparation. As a personal commentary, Plantation has always prided itself in the quality of service Plantation residents receive. It is all due in part to our loyal, hardworking staff and employees. All of our departments are inner-dependent on each other; none can stand alone. The words of a wise man were instilled in her long before she was an Elected Official; "To value ones employees". She applauded everyone who has provided the foundation to make this an extraordinary home town. The applause also goes to "Team Plantation", who will continue to sustain and maintain that vision.

Councilman Levy thanked Ms. Moale for the presentation. He is proud of the Tier 2 program; however, he believed that it lacked an important element. While discussing reduced costs for the City and static health costs, which would normally be going up by major percentages, he would like to have been told what the increased cost to each employee for every doctor's visit or every prescription was in order to maintain that health cost stabilization. During that time the co-pay as well as the cost for prescriptions went up and the insurance company seems to have a hold on us because they regulate prescriptions. He believes that if a report is done in the future, it should note the burden being placed on the individual employee in order to keep the costs contained.

Ms. Moale advised that UHC contracts with hundreds of pharmaceutical companies and it is these companies that change the drugs and costs. If a drug is no longer available under UHC, there is always an alternative drug that you can take. The tiers might change co-pays; that was part of partnering with employees. Medco, which is mail order, can get you three months of prescriptions for two months cost. If anyone has a problem with their prescriptions they should contact Beverly Ambrosio. UHC does provide reports that show the total cost for visits, the ER, and specialists; she will see how it can be broken down for Council.

In response to Councilwoman Uria, Ms. Moale stated that the attrition rate is down around 3%. One day's payroll without FOP is about \$106,000. The cost savings going to the Tier 2 on the FOP is from the actuary. With regard to pay scales and how many people are in those pay scales, Ms. Moale did not understand the question when it was asked; however, she can provide the information.

Councilperson Stoner indicated that days off on the website page do not agree with the chart. She stated that there was a previous discussion regarding retired officials and it was believed that some of them have other primary employment that would take precedent over the City paying their benefits. Councilperson Stoner noted that one of the continuing items that come up is that the employees want a say. She questioned whether any of the employees have brought any potential ideas to the table. When preparing a budget we have to see what we can collectively do without.

In response to Councilperson Stoner, Ms. Moale stated there are probably 200 to 250 exempt employees and the rest are non-exempt hourly employees, including the FOP. Exempt employees are considered to be on salary. Ms. Moale clarified that exempt employees work 37.5 hours per week with an hour for lunch; however, they do not take any breaks. Benefits are calculated on 40 hours per week. Paper timesheets are no longer done; time is kept electronically with ADP Time Keeping Attendance Records, which are monitored by the supervisors through the chain of command up to the director, who submits payroll to Human Resources, who then processes payroll. With regard to the Wellness Clinic, the City set a policy when the Care Center was created, to allow employees to be able to go to the Care Center on City time without clocking out. Each visit is not even 20 minutes and generally they are in and out in 30 minutes instead of taking three or four hours off to go to the doctor.

Mayor Bendekovic indicated that with regard to retired officials, a contract was signed and it cannot be changed. If anyone attempts to change the contract there will be a law suit; this has been tried before. With regard to employee suggestions, Mayor Bendekovic advised that we have an Employee Relations Board and every department has representation on that Board. Employees do come up with suggestions and we have followed through with some and some of them cannot be followed through. She has an open door policy and any one of the employees can come to her with suggestions but they usually go to their directors.

Ms. Moale stated that the Employee Relations Board meets quarterly and she can pull the last couple of years to provide all of the suggestions. Employees know that we are facing difficult times and they have come up with some creative ideas.

Mayor Bendekovic commented that when looking at the budget it was a difficult decision for every one of us to do the 4% contribution towards the health insurance. She went department to department to explain why this contribution was recommended; however, the employees understood. The employees are involved and they are informed. Webcasting has opened avenues for them to be more informed.

Councilman Levy mentioned a previous discussion about a gentleman who wanted to move up in his career and work for the Building Department. A training program was set up and the Director said that he would be responsible and make sure that person was qualified within the year. We all said that we would like to establish something formerly whereby employees who are not necessarily totally qualified for a higher position can get qualified and moved up into that position and be qualifiable within a year or so with the Department Head taking responsibility to make sure that if that person is to stay in that department that they get the qualifications and that they would come into the job not being paid the same as people who were fully qualified, but at a 10% reduction until they got the qualifications, which gives them the incentive to not only take the training or whatever is necessary to get that increase in pay. He questioned whether this has been developed or thought of in any way because with budget coming, it would be nice to have that as something to vote on.

Ms. Moale advised that we have had a trainee program for several years. The FLSA (Fair Labor Standards Act) has a provision that allows you to pay an employee 10% to 20% less than the starting pay if they do not meet the qualifications but they are almost there. That particular employee we discussed about six months ago did get all of his certifications and he was given his increase to bring him up to the minimum pay. This is done in the classifications where it can be done. Typically if they are in classifications, the trainees are in classifications that have certifications to acquire. This is already formalized by law; nothing else has to be done.

In response to Councilwoman Uria, Mayor Bendekovic indicated that as far as the budget next year, we are currently at 25%. Every month she looks to see who is over and under budget.

Councilwoman Uria commented that the revenue in the Building Department went up this month.

Mayor Bendekovic stated that last year the City of Plantation had development and redevelopment that no other City had. This year we are looking at approximately \$259 million worth of development and redevelopment going on in the City and that means revenue and Building permits.

Kevin Swan, employee, commented that Council has done a great job and everything is going well. Over 39% of the employees are residents and not only are they residents, but some of their brothers, sisters and parents are residents; therefore, they are almost responsible to their parents or neighbors as to how the money is spent. There is no money being misspent. When it comes to the issue with the half hour during lunches; most of the employees do not take a break. He indicated that a lot of the Parks and Recreation, Public Works and Utilities employees give a 110%. They work in the summer time when it is 100 degrees and they take a well deserved ten or fifteen minute break at 9:00 a.m., which is the only break they take all day. Mr. Swan complimented the entire Council.

Councilwoman Uria noted that some of the salaried employees work over and Council is aware of that.

Mr. Swan commented by not making this a Workshop tonight created government in the Sunshine and the employees were very civil. He is very proud of the fact that these employees waited until the last ten minutes of the evening in order to give our two cents to the issue. Employees know that costs are important and have to be reigned in but on that same note benefits are extremely important. Even though Pensions are under attack right now, ours is not one of them. All of the employees are very serious about the Defined Benefit Pension Plan. He noted that the Tier 2 Plan drastically reduces the exposure for the City. If you look at a period of eight years the expected savings is \$1.8 million and that amount will grow as time goes on. The attrition level is growing because the City has had a lot of people retire. Mr. Swan advised that there is an anxiety level every time someone says there is a Pension meeting. It is human nature to think the worst and it is not good for moral. He believes that when there are Workshop meetings consultants that actually work on our Pension Board should be brought in because they will give a clear concise view of the Defined Benefit Plan versus any other type of plan.

Councilwoman Uria indicated that Council's job is to look at everything but just because they are looking does not mean that something will be implemented or taken away. They appreciate each and every one of the employees.

Dennis Conklin, resident, thanked the City for producing the report that was presented tonight online so that the public could read along if they wished to do so. There were some very interesting facts noted about the Pension. He referenced page 22. As he has mentioned over the years about urging the City to seriously consider, for the sake of the employees as well as the taxpayers, the transition from the Defined Benefit Plan to a Defined Contribution Plan. At the time of the Tier 2 discussion and eventual acceptance, the information mentioned that it would only save 2% of the Pension costs. That is the main reason he wants to encourage the City to immediately stop the Defined Benefit Plan and get everyone into a Defined Contribution Plan, which will take the taxpayers off the hook for benefits from then on. It may also save our valuable loyal employees a financial disaster in the future. Page 22, which deals with Tier 1 and Tier 2, shows what he has been trying to explain; the cost savings projected is \$102 for the entire year for each of the employees. Only \$738 will have been saved by the year 2019. The General Fund with \$24 million of unfunded liability as of 2009; the total is basically \$84 million as of 2009. The figures for 2010 and 2011 are not available at this time. He appreciates the employees and the effort but someone needs to act on this change.

Mr. Conklin wished everyone a Happy New Year.

Gayle Easterling, Senior Planner, made the following comments:

- She appreciated the fact that this was kept as an open discussion. If you want to form a partnership with the employees it is important to keep open communication and Workshops increase the anxiety that Mr. Swan mentioned, where employees do not feel like they are participating.
- Employees are very hard working and if you check with most of the Administrators, most employees work well over 40 hours.
- The healthcare costs and some of the reductions of the small benefits have been significant to the employees, especially the healthcare costs, which should be considered.
- She would like Council to take into consideration that there are a lot of older employees that have been with the City for a very long time and they will be leaving for retirement. With attrition increasing you have to remember the benefit package that young educated professionals are looking for when they are job seeking as the economy improves. We have a ten-year vesting for our pension, which is longer than the industry standard for most people in local government. The benefits in the past have outweighed that ten-year vesting but as some of the benefits begin to come more in line with the industry standards the vesting on the pension will be a downside.

* * * * *

LEGISLATIVE ITEMS – None.

* * * * *

QUASI-JUDICIAL CONSENT AGENDA – None.

* * * * *

QUASI-JUDICIAL ITEMS – None.

* * * * *

COUNCILMEMBERS' COMMENTS

Mayor Bendekovic indicated that she had the opportunity to do the State of the City address at the Plantation Chamber of Commerce today.

The next meeting will be held on January 25, 2012.

City Hall will be closed on January 16, 2012 in honor of Martin Luther King, Jr. Day. She hoped to see everyone at the Martin Luther King Inter Faith Multi Culture Celebration on Sunday, January 15, 2012.

She wished everyone a Happy New Year.

* * * * *

Councilman Levy wished everyone well.

* * * * *

Councilman Tingom announced that food trucks will be at South Plantation High School Stadium on Friday night between 4:00 p.m. and 9:00 p.m.

The Kiwanis Car Show will be held on February 19, 2012.

He complimented Mayor Bendekovic on the State of the City message this morning; it was very well received at the Plantation Chamber of Commerce.

* * * * *

In response to Councilperson Stoner, Mayor Bendekovic advised that she would provide copies of the State of the City address to all of the Council members.

* * * * *

Councilperson Stoner mentioned yesterday's County Commission agenda that contained an item from the City to adopt a Resolution to levy a new non ad valorem tax for the year 2012, which passed on the Consent Agenda.

In response to Councilperson Stoner, Mr. Shimun indicated that they have not yet decided on what kind of tax this will be; it was decided to leave that option open.

Mayor Bendekovic stated that the stormwater will be brought back to Council sometime in February 2012.

* * * * *

Councilman Jacobs mentioned the towing fiasco that occurred on Black Friday in Sunrise. He questioned whether we need to look at something similar or if we are fine the ways things are in the City. There were abuses that occurred and we may need to be proactive. He reviewed the towing ordinance and it addresses some of the issues already.

Mayor Bendekovic advised that she would look into it.

* * * * *

Councilwoman Uria commented that at one time we were amending the ordinance for massage parlors and it has not come back.

Mr. Lunny indicated that the delay is his; he and Mr. Leeds have discussed this.

In response to Councilwoman Uria, Mr. Leeds stated that they are working on the ordinance pertaining to the garage issue. He has a draft prepared and it will be on the Mayor's desk either Friday or early next week. This has already been discussed with the City Attorney and it is a matter of putting it on the agenda.

* * * * *

Councilwoman Uria advised that she has the Resolution that Mr. Conklin has requested be reviewed.

* * * * *

PUBLIC REQUESTS OF THE COUNCIL CONCERNING MUNICIPAL AFFAIRS

Dennis Conklin, resident, was present. He mentioned that the Florida Green Building Coalition, which is ICLEA, is all over the City’s website. The City’s report can be compared to the Florida Green Building Coalition. He noted that it is not just the flag in the lobby.

Councilwoman Uria stated that the comment is noted.

* * * * *

SEALED COMPETITIVE SOLICITATIONS – None.

* * * * *

WORKSHOPS – None.

* * * * *

Meeting adjourned at 9:50 p.m.

Sharon Uria, President
City Council

ATTEST:

Susan Slattery
City Clerk

RECORD ENTRY:

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the Original of the foregoing signed Minutes was received by the Office of the City Clerk and entered into the Public Record this _____ day of _____, 2012.

Susan Slattery, City Clerk